Jury Trial in Abuse, Neglect, Dependency Cases

Linda A. Szymanski, Esq., Director of Legal Research, NCJJ

As of the end of 2003, the following 11 states (Colorado, Maine, Massachusetts, Michigan, Montana, Oklahoma, South Dakota, Texas, Virginia, Wisconsin, and Wyoming) have statutes or case law that permit or require a jury trial in abuse, neglect, dependency cases. In Virginia, the jury is called an “advisory jury.”

The other 40 jurisdictions have case law or statutes or local court rules or common practice that specifically prohibits a jury trial in abuse, neglect, dependency cases. However, state legislatures in these remaining 40 jurisdictions continue to discuss and debate the issue of jury trials in abuse, neglect, dependency cases.

For example, on December 18, 2003, the Governor of Arizona approved legislation granting the right to a jury trial, if requested, by the parent, guardian or custodian whose parental rights were to be terminated. Although the Bill had language granting jury trials in abuse or neglect cases, if requested, this language was not included in the Bill that finally passed.

On April 23, 2003, the Hawaii House of Representatives adopted a Concurrent Resolution requesting the State Auditor to consult with national entities with child welfare expertise, and to conduct program audits of the Child Protective Services Division of the Hawaii Department of Human Services, the Department of the Attorney General, the Family Courts, and the police department of each county on the issue of child abuse and neglect within the state. One of the listed focus points of the audit is a discussion of the pros and cons of the right to a jury trial for parents accused of child abuse, a right currently not available in Hawaii.

Also, in 2003, the state of Illinois introduced a Bill giving a parent the right to demand a trial by jury in any proceeding seeking a finding that a minor is neglected, abused, or dependent. This Bill failed to pass.

Of the states that do have jury trials in abuse, neglect, dependency hearings, in Colorado, any respondent, or the guardian ad litem may demand a jury trial at the adjudicatory hearing of an abuse, neglect, dependency case. In addition, the court, on its own motion may order such a jury trial. The jury consists of 6 people. In Michigan, the right to a jury trial belongs to any person with standing in the case.

In Oklahoma, a parent, the state or a child has the right to demand a jury trial, but only when the petition to determine if a child is deprived also contains a request for termination of parental rights. The demand for a jury trial must be granted unless the parties waive the right to a jury trial. However, the court, on its own motion may order a jury trial. As in Colorado, Michigan and Wisconsin, the jury consists of 6 people.

Under Wyoming law, a party against whom a petition has been filed or the District Attorney may demand a trial by jury at an adjudicatory hearing. Demand for a jury trial must be made to the court not later than 10 days after the party making the demand is advised of his right to a jury trial. Failure of a party to demand a jury trial is a waiver of this right.

State courts that have addressed the issue of a constitutional right to a jury trial in an abuse, neglect, dependency case use the argument from history to state that there is no such right. The courts’ position on this argument is that the constitutional guarantee of a jury trial does not apply to an abuse, neglect, dependency case because such proceedings were unknown at common law.

This Snapshot was supported by grant #2002-JN-FX-0001(S-1) from the Office of Juvenile Justice and Delinquency Prevention, U.S. Department of Justice. Points of view or opinions contained within this document are those of the author and do not necessarily represent any official position, policy, or view of the U.S. Department of Justice.

Anyone may use the content of this publication for educational purposes, we only ask that you identify the material as being the property of NCJJ. If you want to use this publication for commercial purposes or alter its content, you need our permission.


ISSN 1093-9369